



Grand Awards Judging Team Captain

Best of CSEF Judging Process

- The Best of CSEF Judging Process is intended to be fair, expedient and transparent.
- Observers are only allowed when approved by both the Best of CSEF Captain and the Judging Coordinator. The Best of CSEF Captains need to check the Exhibit Hall to ensure that there are no students or parents still present before beginning.
- The Captain or, if designated by that category's Captain, the Assistant Captain, for each category of the division needs to be present during the entire judging process.
- Dinner is provided by the CSEF and should be consumed during the Orientation shown below.
- Prior to the start of the Best of CSEF judging, the Judging Coordinator will provide a worksheet and poster for each division showing the alphabetical listing of each category, the category, project number and title of the category's 1st place project. Each category will be given a letter to refer to in the voting process.
- **Currently, there are 12 categories in both divisions. Three (3) Best of CSEF Awards are to be decided for the Junior Division and five (5) Best of CSEF Awards are to be decided for the Senior Division.**

Orientation:

The Best of CSEF Captain shall remind the Category Captains that each project at the CSEF is assumed to have been approved by the Scientific Review Committee and is to be judged upon the merits of the project itself and the associated interview and not on race, religion, gender, school, grade, teaming or adults associated with project.

The process below should be summarized with the group of Category Captains before beginning, emphasizing that all ties will need to be broken by repeated voting that will only involve the tied projects.

Presentations:

Each Category Captain will be given **up to ten minutes total** to present their category's 1st place poster, including:

- A. Describing the project and the associated interview.
- B. Summarizing any pertinent discussion from their judging team.
- C. Answering questions from the other Category Captains. The other Category Captains are encouraged to ask any questions they may have as long as they pertain to the project, the student and/or the judging.

The Best of CSEF Judging Team will then proceed to the next category and continue the process until all 12 category 1st place winners have been presented.

Upon completion of all presentations, the Category Captains will be given a five minute break and then convene in front of the poster list of categories with the 1st place titles.

No further discussion of the projects is to take place other than clarification, if necessary, as to which project belongs to which category, and the voting process.

Initial Voting:

The Category Captains will be asked to vote by the letter of the category for their top three projects, in no particular order, for the Junior Division, and the top five projects, in no particular order, for the Senior Division.

Junior Division:

- For the Junior Division each Category Captain will have 3 votes for an available total of 36.
- The Best of CSEF Junior Division Captain will tally the votes of each Category Captain, including their own, assigning one point to each vote.
- The top three projects are then announced to the Category Captains and the others are removed from further Best of CSEF consideration.
- Voting to break any ties will only apply to the third spot available. To break a tie all 12 Category Captains will vote for one of the projects tied for the third spot. Whichever project receives the most votes will then become the third project to stay in the competition for Best of CSEF.
- Repeat this process until only one project remains for the third spot. If there is a repeating tie, then the Best of CSEF Junior Division Captain's vote will be counted twice to break the tie and establish the top 3 projects.

Senior Division:

- For the Senior Division each Category Captain will have 5 votes for an available total of 60.
- The Best of CSEF Senior Division Captain will tally the votes of each Category Captain, including their own, assigning one point to each vote.
- The top five projects are then announced to the Category Captains and the others are removed from further Best of CSEF consideration.
- Voting to break any ties will only apply to the fifth spot available. To break a tie, all 12 Category Captains will vote for one of the projects tied for the fifth spot. Whichever project receives the most votes will then become the fifth project to stay in the competition for Best of CSEF.
- Repeat this process until only one project remains for the fifth spot. If there is a repeating tie, then the Best of CSEF Senior Division Captain's vote will be counted twice to break the tie and establish the top 5 projects.

Final Voting:

With no discussion except regarding the voting process, each Category Captain will rank the remaining projects (3 in the Junior Division, 5 in the Senior Division). Voting will again be done by the letter of the category. The Best of CSEF Captain will tally each Captains' vote as follows:

- 1st Place = one point
- 2nd Place = two points
- 3rd Place = three points
- 4th Place = four points (for the Senior Division only)
- 5th Place = five points (for the Senior Division only)

The tally will then be listed with the lowest point total taking 1st Place and so on with 72 total points available in the Junior Division and 180 points available in the Senior Division.

Ties will be broken for each place (for example, if there are clear 1st, 4th and 5th Place winners, those places are locked in and the Category Captains will be asked to vote only between the tied places of 2nd and 3rd).

Because there are an even number of categories and therefore an even number of Category Captains, it is possible that there could be ties for all the available places. Should there be a three or more-way tie, re-voting will be conducted using the places and points listed above.

An example (Senior Division) could be as follows:

- With 180 total points available where the lowest total wins, the first three projects are tied at 30 points each while the 4th and 5th projects are tied with 45 points each.
- First, break the tie between 4th and 5th place by having each Senior Division Category Captain vote for one or the other. It is possible the two projects could tie again with 6 votes each. If the tie persists the Best of CSEF Senior Division Category Captain counts their vote twice and the tie is broken.
- For the three-way tie, each of the Senior Division Category Captains should order the projects 1st, 2nd and 3rd, with points assigned as above.
- Hopefully this will eliminate any ties and voting will be completed. If two of the three projects remain tied, then the Senior Division Category Captains will be asked to vote again between just the two tied projects.
- Should the voting produce a repeating tie, the Best of CSEF Captain for the Division will count their vote twice to break the tie.

Ties will be resolved by repeating the voting process with only the projects that are tied. And, if repeated voting fails to break the ties, the Best of CSEF Captain for the division will count their vote twice to break the tie.

Conclusion:

Before the Category Captains disperse, remind them that the results need to remain confidential through Friday night when the announcements are made at the Awards Ceremony.

The Best of CSEF Captains for each division will complete the official judging form provided by the Judging Coordinator listing the places, project numbers and titles of the winning projects and then sign the form. At least one other Category Captain from the respective division should review the listing for accuracy and also sign the form.

All materials used for Best of CSEF judging must be returned to the Judging Coordinator, including the posters. Ensure there is no trash left behind that might reveal the winning projects.

Recommended Materials:

1. Markers to cross off the names of projects no longer in the competition for the Best of CSEF awards.
2. Voting can be done by voice or written ballots. If done by written ballot, file cards, Post-It Notes or loose-leaf paper will be needed as will pens or pencils.
3. Some form of timer, clock or watch is necessary to limit each category presentation to ten minutes.
4. Tape to secure the poster of categories and winning titles.
5. Blank paper to tally results.